FACILITIES MANAGEMENT
AT COLORADO STATE UNIVERSITY

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Artifact Audit: Findings and Recommendations

External Consultant:
Ashley R Grice, EdD (she/her)
ARG Liberation Consulting, LLC
DEI Artifact Audit Overview

- Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) Audit Defined: a systemic process of evidence gathering to inform (report card) an organization around specific DEI goals, policies and practices (culture, values).
  - Holistic view of progress and opportunities

- Criticality of DEI Audit:
  - Reinforce the wealth of cultural capital that communities of color bring to institutions across functional contexts (Yosso, 2005)
  - Identify inequities and gaps
  - Create data-driven strategies
  - Foster employee trust and engagement
  - Enhance organizational reputation
Foundational Definitions Used for Audit:

- **Diversity:** “efforts to recruit and retain a critical mass of students, staff, faculty and administrators who reflect underrepresented and historically excluded social identities (e.g. race, gender, class) (Gurin et al., 2002)”

- **Equity:** “parity in educational outcomes (e.g., persistence, completion) and equity-minded practice is defined as an approach that is race-conscious, reflexive, and predicated on an awareness that institutional policies and practices perpetuate unequal outcomes and therefore must be changed (Dowd & Bensimon, 2015)”

- **Inclusion:** “institutional policies and practices that promote full participation and meaningful interactions among campus constituents from diverse backgrounds (Tienda, 2013)”

*(E.M. Holcombe et al., p. 2, 2024)*
Limitations and Outcomes

Limitations:
- Measuring of Social Constructs
- Deciphering appropriate units of measurements (social phenomenon)
- Contentions between theories and practice
- Limitations of how/what language is used, made sense of and interpreted (bias)
- Instrument design and use (assumptions)
- Human error
- Current Climate within Higher Education (DEI and DEI Practice)

Outcomes for Phase I:
- Organizational Overview
- MCOD Indicator Trend/s
- Opportunities (Recommendations)
### ASSESSMENT TOOLS:

- Multicultural Organizational Development (MCOD) Assessment Tool
- Organizational Readiness Tool (Adapted from the Coalition of Communities of Color and All Hands Raised, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORGANIZATIONAL DIMENSION</th>
<th>Monocultural</th>
<th>Transitional</th>
<th>Multicultural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MISSION/PURPOSE</strong></td>
<td>Exclusive</td>
<td>Non-comittal</td>
<td>Inclusive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ignores differences</td>
<td>Linked with diversity</td>
<td>4-pronged line (Economic, Governance, Social, Environmental)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Driver by dominant groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STRUCTURE/ROLES</strong></td>
<td>Rigid hierarchy</td>
<td>Hierarchical</td>
<td>Shared decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decision-making limited to dominants</td>
<td>Limited teams/matrix</td>
<td>Flat flexible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Glass ceilings</td>
<td>Glass ceilings</td>
<td>Wide access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>POLICIES/PROCEDURES</strong></td>
<td>Disciplinary</td>
<td>History, traditions, values</td>
<td>History, traditions, values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unwritten rules/word of mouth</td>
<td>EEO/AA</td>
<td>Flexible work arrangements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discriminatory</td>
<td>Some supportive policies (e.g., partner benefits)</td>
<td>Fair and transparent performance appraisals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inclusive</td>
<td>Performance appraisals reviewed</td>
<td>Score cards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0 tolerance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INFORMAL SYSTEMS/ CULTURE/NORMS</strong></td>
<td>Open and subtle harassment</td>
<td>Support groups</td>
<td>Multilingual/multicultural symbols/norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Homosexual</td>
<td>“Don’t ask, don’t tell”</td>
<td>Openly confront discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assimilation</td>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PEOPLE/RELATIONSHIPS</strong></td>
<td>Homogeneous/homogeneous</td>
<td>Minimum numbers</td>
<td>Diverse at all levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patriarchal</td>
<td>Guarded/political relations</td>
<td>Dialogue across diverse groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Segregated work teams</td>
<td></td>
<td>Org. learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LEADERSHIP</strong></td>
<td>Charismatic</td>
<td>Bureaucratic</td>
<td>Shared/rotating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Autocratic</td>
<td>Visionary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENVIRONMENT</strong></td>
<td>Exploitation</td>
<td>Limited interaction/ response to shifting demographics</td>
<td>Global focus/local action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opposition to</td>
<td></td>
<td>Socially responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRODUCTS/SERVICES/ TECHNOLOGY</strong></td>
<td>One dimension</td>
<td>Targeted/stereotyped markets</td>
<td>Adapts or enables for new populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Culture neutral”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LANGUAGE USE</strong></td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
<td>Bilingualism tolerated</td>
<td>Fully bi-lingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Standard English”</td>
<td>Dominant language use pressure</td>
<td>Languages rewarded</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Intended Purpose of Assessment Tool/s:

- Help organizations gather baseline data and information to collaboratively identify areas for organizational change and improvement, including specific actions and targets that will lead to improved diversity, equity, and inclusion outcomes (centering racial equity).

- Facilitate the sharing of information, resources, mutual support, and improvement tools.

- Build shared accountability across organizations.
Quotes on why Racial Equity is “centered” in the DEI Audit Process:

“...racial inequities persist in every system across the country, without exception. We can’t find one example of a system where there are no racial disparities in outcomes: Health, Education, Criminal Justice, Employment, and so on. Baked into the creation and ongoing policies of our government, media, and other institutions — unless otherwise countered — racism operates at individual, institutional, and structural levels and is therefore present in every system we examine.”

“...when you look within other dimensions of identity — income, gender, sexuality, education, ability, age, citizenship, and geography — there are inequities based on race. Knowing this helps us take a more intersectional approach, while always naming the role that race plays in people’s experiences and outcomes.”

Health Equity Guide, 2023

https://healthequityguide.org/about/why-lead-with-race/
Artifacts & Assessment Tools

1. FM JEDI Team Website
   - DEI Program and Report Data
2. FM Website
3. CO WINS Website (Partner)
4. FM Climate, Culture and Organizational Data
5. FM Employee Handbook
6. FM Organizational Charts & Demographic Data
7. Job Posting Templates/Announcement Language
8. FM Policy and Operation Procedures

- Analysis Tool: ATLAS.ti:
  Qualitative Analysis Software that bridges human expertise with AI efficiency to provide fast and accurate insights. The software communicates directly with personalized documents and have them automatically coded based on your intent for customized results.
  https://atlasti.com

- Assessment Methodology:
  Summative Content Analysis: a data collection technique used to determine the presence of certain words, themes or concepts within qualitative data; focus on the recurrence or concepts or keywords at a more surface level of analysis (i.e. their frequency).
  https://delvetool.com/blog/content-analysis-vs-thematic-analysis
Overall Analysis of All Artifacts

Across all 8 artifacts that were assessed, 5 major coding themes were captured:

1. Accountability
2. Diversity
3. Evaluation
4. Inclusion
5. Workplace
ACCOUNTABILITY showed up in 4 different contexts:

(1) Preferred Job Qualification: “Personal or professional commitment to diversity as demonstrated by persistent effort, active planning, allocation of resources and/or accountability for diversity outcomes”,

(2) Leadership Accountability (Climate Surveys reflecting less favorable outcomes),

(3) Mandatory Requirements for annual performance plans (inconsistencies across policy/goals/expectations and action),

(4) Discriminatory behaviors experienced across various minoritized identities.
Diversity

- As an organization, there are clear indicators (regardless of range, spectrum and/or repetitive word counts) that emphasize the importance of DIVERSITY across Facilities Management at Colorado State University.

- This includes but isn’t limited to:
  - Divisional Goals,
  - Implementation of Committees,
  - emphasis in climate survey data,
  - and various efforts, programs and initiatives that support diverse populations.

Note: There are notable experiences that differ across various populations.
Evaluation

- EVALUATION, as a theme, notably shows up as a common practice across Facilities Management.

- The importance of evaluation is notably emphasized across 3 artifacts:
  - JEDI Team
  - FM Handbook
  - Culture & Climate data.

- There were inconsistencies, however, noted regarding the translation of the FM Handbook guidance and expectations compared to culture/climate survey data sentiments that center the utilization and execution of performance evaluations as an accountability mechanism.
Inclusion

- **INCLUSION** is the top-repetitive theme for evidence found in support of this value.

- Beyond written text discovered across various artifacts, it is notable that the *JEDI Team* serves as the primary mechanism for visible and demonstrated efforts in this area.

- Finally, Inclusion also extends beyond the internal operations of the organization, by way of serving as an additional mechanism for the overall University community to partner, specifically regarding efforts in executing an inclusive physical campus environment.
Workplace

- Lastly, there is an aspiration for WORKPLACE satisfaction, desirability (recruitment/retention) and safety.
ARTIFACT OVERVIEW
Summary & MCOD Trends
Multicultural Organization Development Model (MCOD) Review:

The Exclusionary Organization (Stage 1):
- Openly maintains the privileged group’s power and privilege.
- Deliberately restricts membership.
- Intentionally designed to maintain dominance of one group over others.
- Overt discriminatory, exclusionary, and harassing actions go unaddressed.
- Unsafe and dangerous environment for marginalized group members.
- **Monocultural organization.**

“The Club” (Stage 2):
- **Maintains privilege of those who have traditionally held power and influence.**
- Monocultural norms, policies, and procedures of privileged culture viewed as the only "right" way: "business as usual”.
- Privileged culture institutionalized in policies, procedures, services, etc.
- Limited number of "token" members from other social identity groups allowed in IF they have the "right" credentials, attitudes, behaviors, etc.
- Engages issues of diversity and social justice only on club member’s terms and within their comfort zone.

(Jackson & Hardiman, 2017, p. 1)
Characteristics of Non-Discrimination Organization:

The Compliance Organization (Stage 3):

- Committed to removing some of the discrimination inherent in the Club organization.
- Provides some access to some members of previously excluded groups.
- No change in organizational culture, mission, or structure.
- Focus: Do not make waves or offend/challenge privileged group members.
- Efforts to change profile of work force (at bottom of organization).
- Token placements in staff positions: Must be "team players" and "qualified":
  * Must assimilate into organizational culture
  * Must not challenge the system or "rock the boat"
  * Must not raise issues of sexism, racism, classism, heterosexism...

The Affirming Organization (Stage 4):

- Demonstrated commitment to eliminating discriminatory practices and inherent advantages.
- Actively recruiting and promoting members of groups that have been historically denied access and opportunity.
- Providing support and career development opportunities to increase success and mobility of members of groups that have been historically denied access and opportunity.
- Employees encouraged to be non-oppressive through awareness trainings.
- Employees must assimilate to organizational culture.

(Jackson & Hardiman, 2017, p. 2)
Characteristics of Multicultural/Inclusive Organization:

**The Redefining Organization (Stage 5):**

- In transition.
- Actively working towards developing an inclusive organization.
- Moving beyond “nondiscriminatory,” “non-oppressive” to proactively inclusive.
- Actively working to create environment that “values and capitalizes on diversity”.
- Actively working to ensure full inclusion of all members to enhance growth and success of organization.
- Questions limitations of organizational culture: mission, policies, programs, structures, operations, services, management practices, climate, etc.
- Engages and empowers all members in redesigning and implementing policies, practices, services and programs to: redistribute power/authority; ensure the inclusion, participation, and empowerment of all members; and meet the needs of the increasingly diverse populations served by the organization.

**The Multicultural Organization (Stage 6):**

- Mission, values, operations, and services reflect the contributions and interests of the wide diversity of cultural and social identity groups.
- Leaders and members act on the organizational commitment to eradicate all forms of oppression within the organization.
- Members across all identity groups are full participants in decision-making.
- Actively works in larger communities (regional, national, global) to eliminate all forms of oppression and to create multicultural organizations.

(Jackson & Hardiman, 2017, p. 2-3)
A Multicultural Organization

1. Clear commitment to creating an inclusive organization.
2. Seeks, develops, and values the contributions and talents of all members.
3. Includes all members as active participants in decisions that shape the organization.
4. Employees reflect diverse social and cultural groups throughout all levels of the organization; and demonstrate the multicultural competencies to address the increasing diversity among the populations they serve.
5. Acts on its commitment to eliminate all forms of exclusion and discrimination within the organization, including racism, sexism, heterosexism, ageism, classism, disability oppression, religious oppression, genderism, etc.
6. Follows through on broader social and environmental responsibilities.

(Jackson & Hardiman, 2017, p. 1-3)
### Demographic Data & Organizational Charts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employee Count</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Minority</th>
<th>Latinx</th>
<th>American Indian or Alaska Native</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Black or African American</th>
<th>Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander</th>
<th>white</th>
<th>Two or More Races</th>
<th>Race Unknown</th>
<th>Veteran</th>
<th>Not Veteran</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>465</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Artifact Overview:**
- Organizationally, Facilities Management (FM) at Colorado State University is, demographically, predominantly white (69.2%) and male (74.84%).
- When compared to U.S. statistics (2021) for Facility Managers, Colorado State University reflects industry norms.
- When compared to the State of Colorado Race demographics, Facilities Management reflects comparable percentages for Latinx, American Indian or Alaska Native, and Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander by differentials less than 2% for the aforementioned race categories.

**MCOD Indicator Trend/s:**
- **Transitional (positive action):** Committed to making a special effort to include others, especially those in designated protected classes; tolerates the differences that those others bring; seeks to integrate others into systems created under dominant norms. *(Compliance/Affirming Organization)*
FM JEDI Team Website (DEI Program Data & Insights)

Artifact Overview:
- The evidence provided suggests that the Facilities Management JEDI Team at CSU actively promotes diversity, inclusion, and social responsibility. They participate in efforts to increase awareness, education and understanding within the community, in support of the Principles of Community. Facilities Management (FM), at large, shows support and commitment to the efforts of the JEDI Team through intentional efforts in building and sustaining an inclusive physical campus by way of campus partnerships/collaborations, and through providing resources that support training and engagement related to diversity and inclusion. FM also engages in bilingual communication and utilizes the JEDI team as a pathway that welcomes diverse perspectives and feedback from employees.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- **Transitional (positive action):** Committed to making a special effort to include others, especially those in designated protected classes; tolerates the differences that those others bring; seeks to integrate others into systems created under dominant norms. *(Affirming/Redefining Organization)*
FM Website

Artifact Overview:

- The artifact in focus is the Facilities Management website, with evidence including the JEDI Team under the Committees tab, where various survey findings related to diversity and organizational structures can be identified. Beyond the Committees tab, very limited information and/or indicators for diversity, equity and inclusion could be found on this organizational page. In spite of limitations, there is evidence that Facilities Management acknowledges the importance and values of diversity, equity and inclusion in alignment with University Operations vision and Colorado State University’s Community of Practice.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:

- Monocultural (passive club): actively or passively excludes those who are not members of the dominant group; values and promotes the dominant perspective of one group, culture or style. Unclear intent/purpose of organizational structure when considering diversity, equity and inclusion values.

[Compliance/Affirming Organization]
CO WINS Website

Artifact Overview:
- The evidence provided highlights CO WINS commitment to providing quality essential services to everyone, regardless of race or ethnicity. The documents mentioned, such as the CO WINS Constitution and Bylaws, emphasize the rights of members, the importance of inclusivity and diversity, and the responsibility to treat all workers and members fairly. Additionally, the Partnership Agreement and Collective Bargaining Agreement outline plans and actions for advancing equity for all. The 2022 Amended Partnership Agreement also addresses disputes and grievances.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- Non-Discriminating (compliance/affirming): values and integrates the perspective of diverse identities, cultures, styles and groups into the organization’s work; actively includes a diversity of people representing different groups, styles and perspectives across regional areas within the State of Colorado.
FM Climate, Culture and Organizational Data

Artifact Overview:
- The evidence provided includes information about various campus climate surveys conducted in 2016, 2018, and 2021. These surveys were available in both Spanish and English, in web-based and paper hard copy formats. The surveys aimed to gather information about the campus climate and identify any issues or areas needing improvement.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- The MCOD Lens Indicators suggest that the campus climate survey and programmatic data had characteristics of being transitional, monocultural, and multicultural, with limited interaction and response to shifting demographics.
FM Employee Handbook

Artifact Overview:
- *Facilities Management at Colorado State University* is committed to creating a safe work environment and maintains compliance with diversity, equity, and inclusion guidelines. Training and continuous learning opportunities are provided to employees to enhance their skills and knowledge across various functional areas. The employment process ensures fair and open competition and consideration of affirmative action objectives. Performance evaluations guidelines are clear yet lack clear accountability structures. Employees are encouraged to use the grievance procedures if they believe a decision or condition of employment is unjust.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- **Transitional (compliance)**: passively committed to including others without making major changes; seeks to integrate others into systems created under dominant norms.
- **Monocultural (passive club)**: actively or passively excludes those who are not members of the dominant group; includes other members only if they “fit” the dominant norm.
FM Job Posting Templates & Announcement Language

Artifact Overview:
- The evidence provided suggests that Facilities Management at Colorado State University values diversity, equity, and inclusion in its workplace. The University is committed to serving the diverse needs of its community, promoting an equitable and inclusive environment, and developing collaborative relationships. Preferred job qualifications include a personal or professional commitment to diversity, demonstrated through efforts in planning, resource allocation, and accountability for diverse outcomes. CSU's non-discrimination policy prohibits discrimination and harassment based on various protected characteristics and commits to achieving a diverse workforce. The university emphasizes a commitment to diversity and inclusion in its mission and values.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- **Transitional (compliance/positive action)**: passively committed to including others without making major changes; includes only a few members of other groups; seeks to integrate others into systems created under dominant norms.
- *Note: (absence of search process policies and practices that align with diversity, equity and inclusion values).
FM Policy & Operation Procedures

Artifact Overview:
- Based on the overall assessment of the Facilities Management Policy and Operations Procedures artifact, there was limited evidence found that would indicate intentional values, practice and commitment to diversity, equity and inclusion. While Facilities Management facilitates and informs effective formal and informal complaint procedures, specifically regarding the Smoking Policy, there was no explicit evidence found for where to make complaints for diversity, equity and inclusion related issues.

MCOD Indicator Trend/s:
- Monocultural committed to dominant values and norms; values and promotes the dominant perspective of one group, culture or style.
CONSULTANT RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary
Organizational Charts and Demographic Data:

- Create intentional and visible structures, policies and processes that are reflective of existing demographic and future vision and goals for workforce.
- Critically and consistently assess and examine organizational culture, using intersectional strategies, to ensure systemic alignment with existing demographic data.
- Ensure organizational leadership is consistent and reflective of organizational demographics across all functional areas.
- Create and embed intentional organizational structure/s that center diversity, equity and inclusion as a primary job function.
FM JEDI Team Website:

- Redefine purpose and identity alignment (i.e. what does “JEDI” mean in group composition and practice?).
- Provide definition and practical evidence for “Justice” and “Equity”.
- Establish a clear threshold for required competencies for group membership and/or establish committee policy and practices for how group members will obtain competency across all areas of “Justice, Equity, Diversity and Inclusion”. 
FM Website:

- Create visible, accessible and explicit commitment to diversity, equity and inclusion values on homepage.
- Clearly define the intent and purpose of the JEDI Team. The existing language and passive positioning is misaligned with the systemic and structural realities of Facilities Management at large and disregards limitations and capacity of existing membership highlighted through the committee tab.
- Assess all Facilities Management websites and content for accessibility and language interpretation capabilities, to align with organizational demographic and cultural needs.
- Consult, collaborate and partner with the Office of Inclusive Excellence to ensure diversity, equity and inclusion efforts are in alignment with larger campus goals and practices.
CO WINS Website:

- Create partnership guidelines that explicitly require organizations to provide evidence of their organizational diversity, equity and inclusion policies and practices (expansion beyond performative statements).
- Assess for organizational awareness, insight and impact of external partnerships using a diversity, equity and inclusion lens.
- Create (systemic) policy regarding parameters and commitment to partner with external vendors and organizations that align with your organizational diversity, equity and inclusion values.
FM Climate, Culture & Organizational Data:

- Based on available disaggregated data, create intentional and consistent strategies to engage and address less favorable experiences across race/ethnicity, gender/gender-identity, SES, nationality/country of origin, and physical/mental-ability (visible and non-visible).
- Create consistent and intentional accountability processes across all organizational levels and ensure processes are accessible and transparent.
- Address various levels of equity, inclusive of but not limited to; pay, incentives, staffing and promotion policy/processes.
FM Employee Handbook:

- Revise employee handbook to reflect federal, state and local laws related to diversity, equity and inclusion (compliance).
- Provide clear guidance (code of conduct) for how the organization, across all functional areas, should embed diversity, equity and inclusion best practices and behaviors in daily work.
- Create clear guidelines for how to conduct an accessible and inclusive onboarding process, that is reflective of the organization’s commitment and cultural expectations regarding diversity, equity and inclusion, for all employees.
FM Job Posting Templates & Announcement Language:

- Ensure search committees, processes and practices are in alignment with University and FM’s commitment to diversity, equity and inclusion.

- Create interview processes and questions that align with preferred job qualifications that center diversity, equity and inclusion and determine a threshold for candidates that cannot contribute to these values/practices throughout the interview process.

- Create opportunities for candidates to provide feedback regarding diversity, equity and inclusion efforts and practices experienced throughout the search process, regardless of if candidates matriculate to final round (assess experience, culture and impact).
FM Policy & Operation Procedures:

- Assess existing policies and operation procedures with a diversity, equity and inclusion lens to identify areas and/or gaps for organizational improvement.

- Create policy that purposefully targets but isn’t limited to: Small Disadvantaged Businesses (SDB); Veteran-Owned Small Businesses (VOSB); Women-Owned Small Businesses (WOSB); and Economically Disadvantaged Women-Owned Small Businesses (EDWOSB).
ACTION PLANNING

Next Steps: Operationalizing DEI Audit Findings and Recommendations
Operationalizing Diversity, Equity & Inclusion

- Establish some foundational framing for your organization (i.e. SEL, MCOD practices, values).
- Identify opportunities for organizational capacity to operationalize DEI Values (structural capacity).
- Co-create 1-4 organizational goals/actions* with embedded assessment to conceptualize impact and value (moving beyond performative programming & education).
- Continue to invest in informed-based practices (Phase II and Beyond).